



PROOF OF HEAVEN EXPOSE DEBUNKED

DR. EBEN ALEXANDER

skeptiko.com

1
00:00:11,259 --> 00:00:08,839
on this episode of skeptic Oh Alex talks

2
00:00:14,330 --> 00:00:11,269
with Robert Mays about his commentary

3
00:00:16,880 --> 00:00:14,340
Esquire article on Evan Alexander

4
00:00:19,910 --> 00:00:16,890
distorts the facts tell us what the

5
00:00:22,400 --> 00:00:19,920
rainbow thing is all about and then tell

6
00:00:25,300 --> 00:00:22,410
us what you found out in the book on

7
00:00:28,400 --> 00:00:25,310
Sunday morning according to the story

8
00:00:31,070 --> 00:00:28,410
dr. Alexander wrote his sister Phyllis

9
00:00:35,060 --> 00:00:31,080
and his mother Betty were coming into

10
00:00:37,880 --> 00:00:35,070
the hospital and saw a perfect rainbow

11
00:00:39,590 --> 00:00:37,890
and they felt that this was a fine

12
00:00:41,840 --> 00:00:39,600
look districts been asked a

13
00:00:43,430 --> 00:00:41,850

meteorologist whether there could have

14

00:00:44,840 --> 00:00:43,440

been a rainbow then and the

15

00:00:46,490 --> 00:00:44,850

meteorologist said well the day was

16

00:00:48,260 --> 00:00:46,500

clear so there couldn't have been and I

17

00:00:51,200 --> 00:00:48,270

said well wait a minute two people said

18

00:00:54,529 --> 00:00:51,210

they thought so I called Phyllis

19

00:00:57,979 --> 00:00:54,539

Alexander and she said definitely we saw

20

00:00:59,479 --> 00:00:57,989

a rainbow mother betty was remarked that

21

00:01:01,430 --> 00:00:59,489

it was the perfect rainbow they talked

22

00:01:03,170 --> 00:01:01,440

about it and just to add a little tidbit

23

00:01:04,609 --> 00:01:03,180

that you talked about in your article

24

00:01:06,289 --> 00:01:04,619

that I thought was great and it's real

25

00:01:07,730 --> 00:01:06,299

the real kind of journalism we would

26

00:01:09,820 --> 00:01:07,740

have liked to have gotten from Esquire

27

00:01:12,920 --> 00:01:09,830

is so you not only talked to these

28

00:01:15,410 --> 00:01:12,930

eyewitnesses which he did not but they

29

00:01:17,270 --> 00:01:15,420

also had evidence because it was such a

30

00:01:19,310 --> 00:01:17,280

spectacular event that they had written

31

00:01:21,140 --> 00:01:19,320

an email they had email documentation

32

00:01:22,399 --> 00:01:21,150

that when they came away that day from

33

00:01:25,190 --> 00:01:22,409

the hospital they wrote someone an email

34

00:01:25,880 --> 00:01:25,200

that wow there's this great rainbow stay

35

00:01:37,320 --> 00:01:25,890

with us

36

00:01:41,140 --> 00:01:39,520

welcome to skeptic aware we explore

37

00:01:43,780 --> 00:01:41,150

controversial science with leading

38

00:01:45,789 --> 00:01:43,790

researchers thinkers and their critics

39

00:01:47,260 --> 00:01:45,799

I'm your host Aleksic Harrison on this

40

00:01:50,020 --> 00:01:47,270

episode of skeptic oh we're going to

41

00:01:52,990 --> 00:01:50,030

take another look at the ebon Alexander

42

00:01:55,570 --> 00:01:53,000

proof of heaven controversy that stirred

43

00:01:58,359 --> 00:01:55,580

up and before we get started I want to

44

00:01:59,820 --> 00:01:58,369

step back and say that this if you've

45

00:02:02,590 --> 00:01:59,830

been following this show is a

46

00:02:05,469 --> 00:02:02,600

reoccurring theme and that is the rather

47

00:02:07,300 --> 00:02:05,479

obvious imbalance there is in the

48

00:02:09,219 --> 00:02:07,310

scientific media and really I guess you

49

00:02:12,190 --> 00:02:09,229

could say the serious media if you get

50

00:02:13,720 --> 00:02:12,200

past the the Oprah's and the feel-good

51
00:02:16,270 --> 00:02:13,730
people if you get down to the serious

52
00:02:20,110 --> 00:02:16,280
media there's a real bias against

53
00:02:23,050 --> 00:02:20,120
anything that links to the spiritual in

54
00:02:25,210 --> 00:02:23,060
a scientific way so the near-death

55
00:02:28,390 --> 00:02:25,220
experience science that we talk so much

56
00:02:30,820 --> 00:02:28,400
about on this show anything paranormal

57
00:02:33,820 --> 00:02:30,830
or parapsychology anything like that

58
00:02:36,820 --> 00:02:33,830
you'll find as we've demonstrated over

59
00:02:39,610 --> 00:02:36,830
and over again on this show not only a

60
00:02:42,190 --> 00:02:39,620
bias but a willingness to misrepresent

61
00:02:43,990 --> 00:02:42,200
and distort science if it achieves the

62
00:02:47,500 --> 00:02:44,000
desired end and the desired end in this

63
00:02:50,020 --> 00:02:47,510

case is clear it is to prop up this idea

64

00:02:52,990 --> 00:02:50,030

that you are just your brain nothing

65

00:02:55,210 --> 00:02:53,000

more that's what drives all this and as

66

00:02:57,729 --> 00:02:55,220

crazy as that proposition is and as

67

00:02:59,620 --> 00:02:57,739

ridiculous as that sounds that someone

68

00:03:02,170 --> 00:02:59,630

would continue to promote that in face

69

00:03:04,990 --> 00:03:02,180

of all the evidence against it that

70

00:03:07,810 --> 00:03:05,000

seems to be what we keep encountering on

71

00:03:10,330 --> 00:03:07,820

this show as we just sort through the

72

00:03:13,690 --> 00:03:10,340

facts so with that I think we can add

73

00:03:16,270 --> 00:03:13,700

this well-done bit of research by an

74

00:03:20,530 --> 00:03:16,280

independent team of Robert and Suzanne

75

00:03:22,479 --> 00:03:20,540

Mays who read the Esquire expose on Evan

76

00:03:25,170 --> 00:03:22,489

Alexander's proof of heaven book and

77

00:03:28,800 --> 00:03:25,180

said wait a minute that doesn't add up

78

00:03:30,880 --> 00:03:28,810

let me go do my own journalistic

79

00:03:33,009 --> 00:03:30,890

investigation so here's my interview

80

00:03:36,309 --> 00:03:33,019

with Robert Mays and we can see what

81

00:03:38,890 --> 00:03:36,319

he's found today we welcome Robert Mays

82

00:03:42,580 --> 00:03:38,900

- skeptic Oh Robert along with his wife

83

00:03:44,110 --> 00:03:42,590

Suzanne have been longtime researchers

84

00:03:46,000 --> 00:03:44,120

and near-death experience in

85

00:03:47,949 --> 00:03:46,010

consciousness studies they've published

86

00:03:49,960 --> 00:03:47,959

quite a few papers and have done

87

00:03:51,580 --> 00:03:49,970

presentations for both the

88

00:03:54,420 --> 00:03:51,590

International Association of near-death

89

00:03:57,400 --> 00:03:54,430

studies conference and the well-known

90

00:04:00,310 --> 00:03:57,410

science of consciousness conference in

91

00:04:03,580 --> 00:04:00,320

Tucson Arizona so anyone who's familiar

92

00:04:06,280 --> 00:04:03,590

with this field very well might have

93

00:04:08,560 --> 00:04:06,290

bumped into the work of these two very

94

00:04:10,810 --> 00:04:08,570

interesting and excellent near-death

95

00:04:13,390 --> 00:04:10,820

experience researchers they're here

96

00:04:16,780 --> 00:04:13,400

today to talk about a new article they

97

00:04:20,170 --> 00:04:16,790

just published titled Esquire article on

98

00:04:21,970 --> 00:04:20,180

Evan Alexander distorts the facts in

99

00:04:24,160 --> 00:04:21,980

which they tell us about their

100

00:04:26,440 --> 00:04:24,170

investigation into the near-death

101
00:04:29,410 --> 00:04:26,450
experience account of Harvard

102
00:04:32,830 --> 00:04:29,420
neurosurgeon Evan Alexander who last

103
00:04:36,480 --> 00:04:32,840
year published a blockbuster bestseller

104
00:04:39,250 --> 00:04:36,490
book titled proof of heaven a

105
00:04:43,090 --> 00:04:39,260
neurosurgeons near-death experience and

106
00:04:45,790 --> 00:04:43,100
journey into the afterlife so with that

107
00:04:47,560 --> 00:04:45,800
I'd like to introduce you to Robert Mays

108
00:04:50,050 --> 00:04:47,570
Robert thanks so much for joining me

109
00:04:52,780 --> 00:04:50,060
today on skeptic oh yeah thank you glad

110
00:04:55,120 --> 00:04:52,790
to be here well great you know before we

111
00:04:58,450 --> 00:04:55,130
dive into this article that you've

112
00:05:00,760 --> 00:04:58,460
published on dr. Evan Alexander's case

113
00:05:03,159 --> 00:05:00,770

and then the book and the controversy

114

00:05:04,900 --> 00:05:03,169

that stirred up around that I thought

115

00:05:07,060 --> 00:05:04,910

maybe you could tell us a little bit

116

00:05:08,860 --> 00:05:07,070

about the research that you and Suzanne

117

00:05:11,290 --> 00:05:08,870

have done you know checking out your

118

00:05:14,020 --> 00:05:11,300

website there's a lot of stuff that you

119

00:05:16,360 --> 00:05:14,030

guys have published in this field tell

120

00:05:19,330 --> 00:05:16,370

us a little bit about that well we have

121

00:05:23,190 --> 00:05:19,340

a basic theory based on the near-death

122

00:05:26,200 --> 00:05:23,200

experience that the mind consciousness

123

00:05:29,219 --> 00:05:26,210

person's consciousness separates from

124

00:05:32,770 --> 00:05:29,229

the body and a near-death experience and

125

00:05:34,060 --> 00:05:32,780

operates independently of it and of

126

00:05:36,340 --> 00:05:34,070

course at the end of the near-death

127

00:05:37,750 --> 00:05:36,350

experience rejoins the body this isn't

128

00:05:39,400 --> 00:05:37,760

something that you've just kind of

129

00:05:41,409 --> 00:05:39,410

dreamt up or anything it's just a

130

00:05:43,780 --> 00:05:41,419

compilation of a lot of research and you

131

00:05:45,700 --> 00:05:43,790

just kind of present your case and I

132

00:05:47,320 --> 00:05:45,710

think what I've seen you do a very fair

133

00:05:49,300 --> 00:05:47,330

job of saying hey doesn't the evidence

134

00:05:51,880 --> 00:05:49,310

point there you do some great stuff on

135

00:05:54,190 --> 00:05:51,890

the phantom limb phenomena which is a

136

00:05:57,219 --> 00:05:54,200

well-known medical phenomena that when

137

00:05:59,710 --> 00:05:57,229

an amputee loses an arm or a leg they

138

00:06:03,460 --> 00:05:59,720

can still have sensations down there and

139

00:06:05,950 --> 00:06:03,470

and you question in a very scientific

140

00:06:07,900 --> 00:06:05,960

dollar leeway whether or not some

141

00:06:10,200 --> 00:06:07,910

research points to that as being further

142

00:06:13,860 --> 00:06:10,210

evidence of this separation between

143

00:06:17,620 --> 00:06:13,870

consciousness and brain function right

144

00:06:21,160 --> 00:06:17,630

right exactly the phantom limbs they are

145

00:06:24,130 --> 00:06:21,170

a region where the limb was that still

146

00:06:26,860 --> 00:06:24,140

has it's a region of consciousness so we

147

00:06:29,170 --> 00:06:26,870

call that a mind to limb that's one of

148

00:06:32,350 --> 00:06:29,180

the pieces of evidence that we use also

149

00:06:36,180 --> 00:06:32,360

a lot of neurological evidence that that

150

00:06:39,220 --> 00:06:36,190

we use because the if you look at

151
00:06:41,230 --> 00:06:39,230
neurological phenomena from the point of

152
00:06:44,740 --> 00:06:41,240
view of well could this be a mind and a

153
00:06:49,590 --> 00:06:44,750
brain operating then a lot of things

154
00:06:52,000 --> 00:06:49,600
start to make a lot of sense for example

155
00:06:56,200 --> 00:06:52,010
Benjamin Libet did quite a number of

156
00:06:58,090 --> 00:06:56,210
studies where he showed that mental

157
00:07:00,010 --> 00:06:58,100
events become conscious only when

158
00:07:02,800 --> 00:07:00,020
there's a sufficient electrical brain

159
00:07:04,570 --> 00:07:02,810
activity otherwise they remain

160
00:07:07,600 --> 00:07:04,580
subliminal and and of course

161
00:07:09,760 --> 00:07:07,610
neuroscientists know that but if you

162
00:07:12,700 --> 00:07:09,770
think about well it requires a certain

163
00:07:16,420 --> 00:07:12,710

amount of electrical activity for there

164

00:07:19,270 --> 00:07:16,430

to be forms of consciousness in in the

165

00:07:22,150 --> 00:07:19,280

mind then that makes that makes a lot of

166

00:07:22,770 --> 00:07:22,160

sense so so we use both neurological

167

00:07:26,020 --> 00:07:22,780

phenomenon

168

00:07:28,420 --> 00:07:26,030

phantom limb phenomena and the NDE

169

00:07:31,240 --> 00:07:28,430

phenomena one of the reasons that I even

170

00:07:33,130 --> 00:07:31,250

brought up the broad research that

171

00:07:36,310 --> 00:07:33,140

you've done into consciousness in

172

00:07:39,100 --> 00:07:36,320

near-death studies is that I think

173

00:07:42,340 --> 00:07:39,110

that plays an important part into this

174

00:07:45,510 --> 00:07:42,350

story we're about to tell about dr. Evan

175

00:07:47,890 --> 00:07:45,520

Alexander and that is that you have done

176

00:07:50,409 --> 00:07:47,900

near-death experience research you've

177

00:07:52,180 --> 00:07:50,419

read many of the dozens and dozens of

178

00:07:54,340 --> 00:07:52,190

scholarly books hundreds of papers

179

00:07:56,620 --> 00:07:54,350

you've met a lot of these people at

180

00:07:59,710 --> 00:07:56,630

conferences interacted with them on a

181

00:08:01,480 --> 00:07:59,720

professional basis I guess the reason I

182

00:08:03,430 --> 00:08:01,490

keep hounding on that is I want to go

183

00:08:06,219 --> 00:08:03,440

back a little bit because I had a chance

184

00:08:08,920 --> 00:08:06,229

to interview dr. eben Alexander in

185

00:08:11,290 --> 00:08:08,930

November of 2011 before he had written

186

00:08:13,120 --> 00:08:11,300

the book and I thanked the listeners of

187

00:08:15,490 --> 00:08:13,130

skeptic oh who alerted me to this guy

188

00:08:17,200 --> 00:08:15,500

said hey here's this guy neurosurgeon

189

00:08:18,790 --> 00:08:17,210

from Harvard

190

00:08:20,620 --> 00:08:18,800

had this brother incredible near-death

191

00:08:22,210 --> 00:08:20,630

experience you think she'd talk to him I

192

00:08:24,460 --> 00:08:22,220

was like wow this is great

193

00:08:29,110 --> 00:08:24,470

but from the beginning my thought was

194

00:08:32,620 --> 00:08:29,120

hey great another fantastic near-death

195

00:08:35,529 --> 00:08:32,630

experience account manely didn't take it

196

00:08:38,800 --> 00:08:35,539

as being that out of the ordinary or

197

00:08:42,130 --> 00:08:38,810

unusual so I guess I was surprised when

198

00:08:45,160 --> 00:08:42,140

the book came out a year later and there

199

00:08:48,010 --> 00:08:45,170

was just this backlash against Alexander

200

00:08:50,440 --> 00:08:48,020

as if this was the first near-death

201
00:08:53,410 --> 00:08:50,450
experience account that had ever come

202
00:08:56,560 --> 00:08:53,420
out or as if there wasn't a substantial

203
00:08:58,960 --> 00:08:56,570
body of research to back up the reality

204
00:09:02,170 --> 00:08:58,970
of this phenomena and I kind of felt

205
00:09:06,160 --> 00:09:02,180
from the beginning that it was much more

206
00:09:10,120 --> 00:09:06,170
of a focus on attacking this one person

207
00:09:13,000 --> 00:09:10,130
than attacking the larger body of

208
00:09:14,139 --> 00:09:13,010
near-death experience research did you

209
00:09:15,790 --> 00:09:14,149
have any similar thoughts for that

210
00:09:18,340 --> 00:09:15,800
Robert did you see it differently when

211
00:09:20,650 --> 00:09:18,350
his book book first came out this is a

212
00:09:23,670 --> 00:09:20,660
kind of pattern I think that skeptics

213
00:09:26,560 --> 00:09:23,680

have they will take the particular

214

00:09:28,269 --> 00:09:26,570

phenomenon and say well that's just an

215

00:09:30,970 --> 00:09:28,279

anecdote and they don't look at the

216

00:09:34,210 --> 00:09:30,980

whole picture of near-death experience

217

00:09:36,610 --> 00:09:34,220

research and see that there are patterns

218

00:09:39,610 --> 00:09:36,620

I mean this happens all the time

219

00:09:42,870 --> 00:09:39,620

when when people claim that you know

220

00:09:45,760 --> 00:09:42,880

some sort of neurological phenomenon

221

00:09:47,199 --> 00:09:45,770

explains near-death experiences because

222

00:09:49,240 --> 00:09:47,209

I'm going to take it back kind of one

223

00:09:51,790 --> 00:09:49,250

step further because when Evan Alexander

224

00:09:54,100 --> 00:09:51,800

comes out with this book before actually

225

00:09:57,280 --> 00:09:54,110

the book even comes out there was a

226

00:10:01,030 --> 00:09:57,290

Newsweek magazine article and he was on

227

00:10:05,730 --> 00:10:01,040

the cover of it and I think that really

228

00:10:09,310 --> 00:10:05,740

riled up the scientific atheistic

229

00:10:12,699 --> 00:10:09,320

mainstream media but maybe for a reason

230

00:10:15,370 --> 00:10:12,709

that is somewhat justified because let's

231

00:10:18,370 --> 00:10:15,380

also be real - you know here's a guy in

232

00:10:21,130 --> 00:10:18,380

eben Alexander who was right guy at the

233

00:10:24,310 --> 00:10:21,140

right place has this amazing story gets

234

00:10:26,769 --> 00:10:24,320

this really substantial book deal and

235

00:10:29,050 --> 00:10:26,779

you can just imagine you know they bring

236

00:10:30,889 --> 00:10:29,060

him in and they say okay buddy here it

237

00:10:32,869 --> 00:10:30,899

is here's your editor

238

00:10:35,210 --> 00:10:32,879

here's your marketing guy here's your

239

00:10:37,699 --> 00:10:35,220

media guy we're gonna get you on the

240

00:10:39,650 --> 00:10:37,709

Today Show all that other stuff and by

241

00:10:43,069 --> 00:10:39,660

the way here's the title of your book

242

00:10:45,379 --> 00:10:43,079

proof of heaven you know which really

243

00:10:47,720 --> 00:10:45,389

kind of sticks it to the atheists right

244

00:10:50,119 --> 00:10:47,730

though the scientific folks are fighting

245

00:10:52,939 --> 00:10:50,129

this religious culture war and here's a

246

00:10:56,509 --> 00:10:52,949

guy coming out with a book title proof

247

00:10:59,660 --> 00:10:56,519

of heaven you've got to know fairly or

248

00:11:02,869 --> 00:10:59,670

unfairly they felt a pretty strong need

249

00:11:06,290 --> 00:11:02,879

to strike back and they did it in the

250

00:11:09,019 --> 00:11:06,300

old time-tested way of if you can't

251
00:11:11,569 --> 00:11:09,029
attack the evidence you know attack the

252
00:11:14,419 --> 00:11:11,579
person and that's what I think is going

253
00:11:18,199 --> 00:11:14,429
on here but I think there was I think

254
00:11:21,859 --> 00:11:18,209
that title proof of heaven did kind of

255
00:11:24,799 --> 00:11:21,869
rile those folks more than than even

256
00:11:28,280 --> 00:11:24,809
usual in this case yes I agree with that

257
00:11:30,739 --> 00:11:28,290
well then let's go ahead and go forward

258
00:11:32,600 --> 00:11:30,749
one additional point I guess I wanted to

259
00:11:34,850 --> 00:11:32,610
bring up on that is because when the

260
00:11:36,860 --> 00:11:34,860
book did come out one of the first guys

261
00:11:40,009 --> 00:11:36,870
who jumped forward and really led this

262
00:11:42,230 --> 00:11:40,019
charge of attack from the science crowd

263
00:11:45,259 --> 00:11:42,240

atheist crowd was Sam Harris and we I

264

00:11:46,939 --> 00:11:45,269

actually had an email exchange with dr.

265

00:11:50,780 --> 00:11:46,949

Harris that I think is pretty revealing

266

00:11:52,910 --> 00:11:50,790

because he came out and immediately said

267

00:11:54,530 --> 00:11:52,920

I don't even know how he could kind of

268

00:11:57,460 --> 00:11:54,540

back this up but he did he wrote this

269

00:11:59,660 --> 00:11:57,470

scathing review and basically challenged

270

00:12:01,309 --> 00:11:59,670

Alexander's integrity to your point

271

00:12:03,049 --> 00:12:01,319

Robert it's the kind of talking points

272

00:12:05,150 --> 00:12:03,059

thing he gets those talking points out

273

00:12:07,489 --> 00:12:05,160

there that we will see repeated over and

274

00:12:09,350 --> 00:12:07,499

over again he it claims that his account

275

00:12:11,480 --> 00:12:09,360

wasn't factual he's basically calling

276

00:12:15,499 --> 00:12:11,490

him a liar and he does all this before

277

00:12:18,019 --> 00:12:15,509

the book is even published so I sent an

278

00:12:20,960 --> 00:12:18,029

email to dr. Alexander and he was nice

279

00:12:24,799 --> 00:12:20,970

enough to respond and I wanted to read

280

00:12:27,799 --> 00:12:24,809

for you the response that dr. Alexander

281

00:12:30,350 --> 00:12:27,809

published because I think it also plays

282

00:12:32,329 --> 00:12:30,360

into the next part of this story that

283

00:12:35,059 --> 00:12:32,339

we're going to get into which is the

284

00:12:37,910 --> 00:12:35,069

article that you and Suzanne wrote where

285

00:12:41,210 --> 00:12:37,920

you really investigated these claims

286

00:12:43,940 --> 00:12:41,220

further but here's what dr. Alexander

287

00:12:47,629 --> 00:12:43,950

wrote in response to

288

00:12:50,569 --> 00:12:47,639

sam Harris's opening salvo in this

289

00:12:53,540 --> 00:12:50,579

battle of whether or not this near-death

290

00:12:57,410 --> 00:12:53,550

experience account is really factual or

291

00:13:00,740 --> 00:12:57,420

not he writes of course it was premature

292

00:13:03,050 --> 00:13:00,750

for sam harris to speak out based on the

293

00:13:05,360 --> 00:13:03,060

Newsweek article he needs to at least

294

00:13:07,730 --> 00:13:05,370

read the book if he wants to avoid

295

00:13:10,220 --> 00:13:07,740

making embarrassing statements that he

296

00:13:12,410 --> 00:13:10,230

later regrets a nice way of saying he's

297

00:13:14,269 --> 00:13:12,420

totally full of crap but anyways he

298

00:13:16,220 --> 00:13:14,279

continues and here's the medical part

299

00:13:19,069 --> 00:13:16,230

that I think plays into the rest of the

300

00:13:21,800 --> 00:13:19,079

story we want to talk about the severity

301
00:13:24,769 --> 00:13:21,810
of my meningitis and it's complete

302
00:13:26,689 --> 00:13:24,779
resistance to therapy for a week should

303
00:13:30,319 --> 00:13:26,699
have eliminated all but the most

304
00:13:32,720 --> 00:13:30,329
rudimentary of conscious experiences and

305
00:13:35,329 --> 00:13:32,730
then he goes on to list a bunch of

306
00:13:37,699 --> 00:13:35,339
medical data that I don't really know a

307
00:13:40,340 --> 00:13:37,709
lot about but I think other people in

308
00:13:42,740 --> 00:13:40,350
the medical profession would understand

309
00:13:46,160 --> 00:13:42,750
he talks about his white blood count

310
00:13:50,509 --> 00:13:46,170
being extremely low he talks about bands

311
00:13:53,930 --> 00:13:50,519
of toxic granulations being at a level

312
00:13:57,350 --> 00:13:53,940
that is very very worrisome and in

313
00:14:01,579 --> 00:13:57,360

particular he talks about his glucose

314

00:14:04,069 --> 00:14:01,589

level being extremely low a 1.0 when

315

00:14:06,699 --> 00:14:04,079

it's normally in the sixty to eighty

316

00:14:11,060 --> 00:14:06,709

range and even in the severe meningitis

317

00:14:13,250 --> 00:14:11,070

drops down to a twenty so I will publish

318

00:14:16,009 --> 00:14:13,260

this I published it once before but all

319

00:14:18,710 --> 00:14:16,019

included in this show so that people who

320

00:14:20,930 --> 00:14:18,720

do want some of these medical facts can

321

00:14:22,490 --> 00:14:20,940

dig into it here's some of the other

322

00:14:25,210 --> 00:14:22,500

points that he makes that I think are

323

00:14:29,090 --> 00:14:25,220

important this is again dr. Alexander

324

00:14:32,540 --> 00:14:29,100

responding to sam harris a couple months

325

00:14:36,110 --> 00:14:32,550

before this whole Esquire thing blows up

326

00:14:39,290 --> 00:14:36,120

and he says going from symptom onset

327

00:14:42,110 --> 00:14:39,300

that is the first symptoms he had of

328

00:14:45,920 --> 00:14:42,120

this spinal meningitis Tacoma within

329

00:14:48,980 --> 00:14:45,930

three hours is a very dire prognostic

330

00:14:52,850 --> 00:14:48,990

sign and he was as we'll get to in a

331

00:14:55,460 --> 00:14:52,860

minute in coma when he he was in and out

332

00:14:57,680 --> 00:14:55,470

of coma when he was first admitted to

333

00:15:00,650 --> 00:14:57,690

the hospital so that is factual and it's

334

00:15:04,160 --> 00:15:00,660

confirmed by the medical records I think

335

00:15:06,680 --> 00:15:04,170

he was in coma continuously we'll get

336

00:15:10,280 --> 00:15:06,690

into that I think that the terms there

337

00:15:12,110 --> 00:15:10,290

the medical terms lose meaning into a

338

00:15:14,420 --> 00:15:12,120

certain extent because what he's really

339

00:15:17,090 --> 00:15:14,430

saying and what all the medical experts

340

00:15:21,070 --> 00:15:17,100

are saying consistently is that he was

341

00:15:24,680 --> 00:15:21,080

in a state of severely compromised

342

00:15:27,440 --> 00:15:24,690

mental brain functioning throughout that

343

00:15:30,320 --> 00:15:27,450

should just not even be controversial so

344

00:15:32,480 --> 00:15:30,330

when we can't start spinning things coma

345

00:15:34,490 --> 00:15:32,490

induced coma all that we'll get to that

346

00:15:37,070 --> 00:15:34,500

but here is a guy who's kind of laying

347

00:15:42,110 --> 00:15:37,080

out some medical facts and he says that

348

00:15:44,150 --> 00:15:42,120

his state would be 90% mortality rate

349

00:15:46,640 --> 00:15:44,160

from the very beginning given this

350

00:15:48,920 --> 00:15:46,650

situation that he has that it came on so

351

00:15:51,140 --> 00:15:48,930

quickly and then he goes on to say

352

00:15:53,030 --> 00:15:51,150

directly to Sam Harris no physician who

353

00:15:55,040 --> 00:15:53,040

knows anything about meningitis will

354

00:15:56,990 --> 00:15:55,050

just blow off the fact that I was

355

00:15:59,810 --> 00:15:57,000

deathly ill in every sense of the word

356

00:16:02,900 --> 00:15:59,820

and that my neocortex was absolutely

357

00:16:04,700 --> 00:16:02,910

hammered he goes on to say at the end my

358

00:16:07,190 --> 00:16:04,710

physicians and their consultants at

359

00:16:09,890 --> 00:16:07,200

University of Virginia Wake Forest Duke

360

00:16:12,860 --> 00:16:09,900

Harvard Stanford and Beyond were

361

00:16:16,990 --> 00:16:12,870

astonished that I recovered which again

362

00:16:19,310 --> 00:16:17,000

I think as we'll get to is backed up in

363

00:16:25,490 --> 00:16:19,320

the article that you wrote which let's

364

00:16:28,730 --> 00:16:25,500

get to because on July 2nd of 2013 this

365

00:16:31,400 --> 00:16:28,740

is seven eight months after the book has

366

00:16:34,390 --> 00:16:31,410

become a best-seller sold two million

367

00:16:37,930 --> 00:16:34,400

copies I received this email from

368

00:16:41,510 --> 00:16:37,940

Esquires editor-in-chief David Granger

369

00:16:44,930 --> 00:16:41,520

he writes this morning we published an

370

00:16:49,070 --> 00:16:44,940

important article by Luke Dietrich about

371

00:16:50,930 --> 00:16:49,080

dr. eben Alexander the author of proof

372

00:16:53,060 --> 00:16:50,940

of heaven which has been one of the

373

00:16:55,490 --> 00:16:53,070

great successes in book publishing this

374

00:16:57,490 --> 00:16:55,500

year the premise of the book was

375

00:16:59,900 --> 00:16:57,500

irresistible a man of science

376

00:17:02,120 --> 00:16:59,910

neurosurgeon is attacked by a rare

377

00:17:04,280 --> 00:17:02,130

disease if that sends him into a coma

378

00:17:07,370 --> 00:17:04,290

indeed causes his brain cease

379

00:17:09,560 --> 00:17:07,380

functioning while he's incapacitated he

380

00:17:11,120 --> 00:17:09,570

has a vivid experience of afterlife

381

00:17:13,220 --> 00:17:11,130

finally after

382

00:17:16,069 --> 00:17:13,230

restored to health he recreates his

383

00:17:18,920 --> 00:17:16,079

journey in book form we had some

384

00:17:21,110 --> 00:17:18,930

questions the editor from eschar writes

385

00:17:23,059 --> 00:17:21,120

we asked contributing editor Luke

386

00:17:26,240 --> 00:17:23,069

Dietrich who's working on a book about

387

00:17:29,330 --> 00:17:26,250

neuroscience what he thought of the

388

00:17:31,310 --> 00:17:29,340

science of Alexander's book Dietrich

389

00:17:33,080 --> 00:17:31,320

spent several months both looking into

390

00:17:35,390 --> 00:17:33,090

Alexander's medical and scientific

391

00:17:39,200 --> 00:17:35,400

background and researching the

392

00:17:42,610 --> 00:17:39,210

fact-based claims the book makes what

393

00:17:45,910 --> 00:17:42,620

he's revealed is a series of omissions

394

00:17:49,340 --> 00:17:45,920

contradictions and inaccuracies in

395

00:17:55,160 --> 00:17:49,350

Alexander's book that cast fresh light

396

00:17:58,180 --> 00:17:55,170

on its remarkable tale so there we have

397

00:18:02,660 --> 00:17:58,190

it this article from Esquire in July of

398

00:18:05,540 --> 00:18:02,670

2013 just created a firestorm the folks

399

00:18:09,200 --> 00:18:05,550

in the scientific atheistic community

400

00:18:10,940 --> 00:18:09,210

just ran with this many had not read the

401
00:18:13,010 --> 00:18:10,950
article it was behind a paywall but

402
00:18:15,170 --> 00:18:13,020
that's their business but many had not

403
00:18:16,820 --> 00:18:15,180
read had read it they just kind of ran

404
00:18:19,640 --> 00:18:16,830
with it this is great with kind of as

405
00:18:23,870 --> 00:18:19,650
you said earlier we've knocked down this

406
00:18:28,280 --> 00:18:23,880
guy who everyone is so excited about his

407
00:18:33,080 --> 00:18:28,290
near-death experience and then last week

408
00:18:35,960 --> 00:18:33,090
that is August 15th of 2013 you Robert

409
00:18:38,060 --> 00:18:35,970
and Suzanne published an article on the

410
00:18:42,380 --> 00:18:38,070
International Association for near-death

411
00:18:44,390 --> 00:18:42,390
studies website and I want to get into

412
00:18:47,540 --> 00:18:44,400
now that article but I want to start

413
00:18:49,670 --> 00:18:47,550

with the conclusion that you write in

414

00:18:52,490 --> 00:18:49,680

that article here's what you write you

415

00:18:54,290 --> 00:18:52,500

and Suzanne the Dietrich article that is

416

00:18:57,520 --> 00:18:54,300

the article published in Esquire is

417

00:19:00,080 --> 00:18:57,530

shoddy and irresponsible journalism

418

00:19:03,500 --> 00:19:00,090

shoddy because of Luke Dietrich's and

419

00:19:05,690 --> 00:19:03,510

his Esquire editors evident failures and

420

00:19:07,940 --> 00:19:05,700

then you list out some of those failures

421

00:19:10,720 --> 00:19:07,950

that I want to talk about you say that

422

00:19:13,640 --> 00:19:10,730

they fail to consider alternative

423

00:19:16,010 --> 00:19:13,650

explanations they fail to check with

424

00:19:18,380 --> 00:19:16,020

sighted witnesses extremely important

425

00:19:20,690 --> 00:19:18,390

most importantly they fail to check with

426

00:19:23,420 --> 00:19:20,700

medical experts on many of the

427

00:19:25,430 --> 00:19:23,430

assertions that they're making and

428

00:19:28,760 --> 00:19:25,440

again right up there with the most

429

00:19:30,860 --> 00:19:28,770

important they failed a check on the

430

00:19:33,080 --> 00:19:30,870

crucial testimony that they get that

431

00:19:34,730 --> 00:19:33,090

this whole thing hinges on and they

432

00:19:38,840 --> 00:19:34,740

don't even bother to see whether they

433

00:19:41,600 --> 00:19:38,850

really got that right so with that very

434

00:19:44,210 --> 00:19:41,610

lengthy introduction and I appreciate

435

00:19:46,010 --> 00:19:44,220

you to us kind of standing by I can only

436

00:19:47,780 --> 00:19:46,020

imagine all the things you have to say

437

00:19:50,090 --> 00:19:47,790

because you've done fantastic research

438

00:19:53,050 --> 00:19:50,100

into this case but with that as an

439

00:19:55,190 --> 00:19:53,060

introduction can you tell us how this

440

00:19:57,140 --> 00:19:55,200

unfolded for you how you became

441

00:20:01,030 --> 00:19:57,150

interested in investigating this Esquire

442

00:20:04,670 --> 00:20:01,040

article and how all that started well I

443

00:20:08,390 --> 00:20:04,680

usually write news articles for our

444

00:20:11,030 --> 00:20:08,400

website the ions website and this is

445

00:20:15,980 --> 00:20:11,040

obviously one that needs to be written

446

00:20:20,750 --> 00:20:15,990

up and analyzed and if there's if there

447

00:20:23,060 --> 00:20:20,760

are things that the that are in the news

448

00:20:25,520 --> 00:20:23,070

article that I'm writing about that need

449

00:20:29,960 --> 00:20:25,530

further investigation like this doesn't

450

00:20:32,630 --> 00:20:29,970

make sense this doesn't seem right

451
00:20:36,680 --> 00:20:32,640
then I go and do whatever investigation

452
00:20:39,220 --> 00:20:36,690
I can so I read Luke Dietrich's article

453
00:20:44,060 --> 00:20:39,230
very carefully and found that the key

454
00:20:46,700 --> 00:20:44,070
criticism was that the coma was really

455
00:20:50,240 --> 00:20:46,710
not meningitis induced coma but was

456
00:20:53,260 --> 00:20:50,250
really chemically induced coma medically

457
00:20:58,280 --> 00:20:53,270
induced coma and that he really wasn't

458
00:21:00,950 --> 00:20:58,290
in a coma he was in and out of a coma he

459
00:21:03,560 --> 00:21:00,960
was in fact what was quoted dr. Potter

460
00:21:04,490 --> 00:21:03,570
was quoted as saying conscious but

461
00:21:07,700 --> 00:21:04,500
delirious

462
00:21:13,730 --> 00:21:07,710
let's introduce who is who is dr. Laura

463
00:21:17,660 --> 00:21:13,740

Potter dr. Potter was the ER physician

464

00:21:21,110 --> 00:21:17,670

when Evan Alexander was brought in on

465

00:21:25,100 --> 00:21:21,120

that Monday morning and so she was in

466

00:21:28,010 --> 00:21:25,110

charge of treating him initially doing

467

00:21:30,100 --> 00:21:28,020

the initial diagnostic tests and so on

468

00:21:34,040 --> 00:21:30,110

okay and she's featured very prominently

469

00:21:35,990 --> 00:21:34,050

in the Esquire article as the medical

470

00:21:37,160 --> 00:21:36,000

expert real quickly and how much you've

471

00:21:41,090 --> 00:21:37,170

gone with your story

472

00:21:44,810 --> 00:21:41,100

is dr. Scott Wade he apparently is the

473

00:21:47,000 --> 00:21:44,820

the lead physician it's an infectious

474

00:21:49,370 --> 00:21:47,010

disease specialist right of course you

475

00:21:51,860 --> 00:21:49,380

would want it with bacterial meningitis

476
00:21:54,440 --> 00:21:51,870
and the Lee you just said an important

477
00:21:57,200 --> 00:21:54,450
word he's the lead physician okay so not

478
00:21:59,930 --> 00:21:57,210
to discredit or demean in any way the

479
00:22:02,480 --> 00:21:59,940
important role that the ER physician dr.

480
00:22:05,150 --> 00:22:02,490
laura potter played but there's other

481
00:22:06,830 --> 00:22:05,160
medical experts in this case that will

482
00:22:08,780 --> 00:22:06,840
hear about here today which is certainly

483
00:22:12,770 --> 00:22:08,790
didn't hear in the eschar article but

484
00:22:15,620 --> 00:22:12,780
continued you were suspicious as I was

485
00:22:17,270 --> 00:22:15,630
and and that hey wait a minute why do

486
00:22:19,730 --> 00:22:17,280
they say that look I had severe men

487
00:22:21,950 --> 00:22:19,740
spinal meningitis you know e coli

488
00:22:24,920 --> 00:22:21,960

bacteria what is his idea that he wasn't

489

00:22:28,690 --> 00:22:24,930

he wasn't really that that that ill so

490

00:22:31,520 --> 00:22:28,700

continue from there so I did say well

491

00:22:33,860 --> 00:22:31,530

could she had said he was conscious but

492

00:22:37,430 --> 00:22:33,870

delirious given all of the medical facts

493

00:22:40,640 --> 00:22:37,440

that were you know present on The

494

00:22:45,740 --> 00:22:40,650

Skeptical website and at other times

495

00:22:50,750 --> 00:22:45,750

that Evan Alexander has presented this

496

00:22:53,620 --> 00:22:50,760

and he and so I called the hospital and

497

00:22:56,200 --> 00:22:53,630

asked to speak to the doctor Potter and

498

00:23:00,920 --> 00:22:56,210

left a message on her voice mail and

499

00:23:03,890 --> 00:23:00,930

didn't get a response I figured that

500

00:23:06,320 --> 00:23:03,900

what I had said a few hours later it

501
00:23:10,010 --> 00:23:06,330
wasn't complete so I called again and

502
00:23:12,200 --> 00:23:10,020
left another message this time I got a

503
00:23:14,030 --> 00:23:12,210
secretary I think just a message and

504
00:23:17,870 --> 00:23:14,040
said she would definitely want to get

505
00:23:22,870 --> 00:23:17,880
that to dr. Potter but I didn't hear

506
00:23:24,830 --> 00:23:22,880
anything at all and over the weekend I

507
00:23:27,080 --> 00:23:24,840
called you know I was worried about

508
00:23:30,500 --> 00:23:27,090
you're interested in this you know how

509
00:23:33,080 --> 00:23:30,510
could there be no rainbow on Sunday

510
00:23:36,050 --> 00:23:33,090
morning when the meteorologist said it

511
00:23:38,000 --> 00:23:36,060
was clear okay cuz let's introduce that

512
00:23:40,130 --> 00:23:38,010
again too because the the Dietrich

513
00:23:41,840 --> 00:23:40,140

article anyone you have to read it you

514

00:23:44,420 --> 00:23:41,850

have Derby because it's it's extremely

515

00:23:47,690 --> 00:23:44,430

well-crafted let's give him that you

516

00:23:49,850 --> 00:23:47,700

know and he builds this case with the

517

00:23:51,020 --> 00:23:49,860

facts that he has but he really builds

518

00:23:54,200 --> 00:23:51,030

his whole thing

519

00:23:55,669 --> 00:23:54,210

this guy's a liar that's the story and

520

00:23:57,320 --> 00:23:55,679

he approaches it from a number of

521

00:23:59,840 --> 00:23:57,330

different angles some of which are

522

00:24:01,880 --> 00:23:59,850

really substantive to the story like the

523

00:24:03,799 --> 00:24:01,890

coma thing and these other things that

524

00:24:05,630 --> 00:24:03,809

he just kind of picks at but they do

525

00:24:08,030 --> 00:24:05,640

kind of stick in your mind as you're

526

00:24:10,940 --> 00:24:08,040

reading the article like the rainbow

527

00:24:13,430 --> 00:24:10,950

thing tell us what the the rainbow thing

528

00:24:14,240 --> 00:24:13,440

is all about and then tell us what you

529

00:24:18,830 --> 00:24:14,250

found out

530

00:24:22,160 --> 00:24:18,840

well in the book on Sunday morning

531

00:24:26,330 --> 00:24:22,170

according to the story dr. Alexander

532

00:24:29,740 --> 00:24:26,340

wrote his sister Phyllis and his mother

533

00:24:33,830 --> 00:24:29,750

Betty were coming into the hospital and

534

00:24:36,350 --> 00:24:33,840

saw a perfect rainbow and they felt that

535

00:24:39,790 --> 00:24:36,360

this was a sign dittrick took this as

536

00:24:44,810 --> 00:24:39,800

saying well heaven itself was heralding

537

00:24:48,320 --> 00:24:44,820

heaven Alexander's return and and then

538

00:24:50,480 --> 00:24:48,330

the district then said asked a

539

00:24:52,160 --> 00:24:50,490

meteorologist whether there could have

540

00:24:53,570 --> 00:24:52,170

been a rainbow then and the

541

00:24:55,669 --> 00:24:53,580

meteorologist said well the day was

542

00:24:58,190 --> 00:24:55,679

clear so there couldn't have been and I

543

00:25:01,700 --> 00:24:58,200

said well wait a minute somebody two

544

00:25:04,100 --> 00:25:01,710

people said they they saw it so I called

545

00:25:09,230 --> 00:25:04,110

Phyllis Alexander and she said

546

00:25:13,130 --> 00:25:09,240

definitely we saw a rainbow was a the

547

00:25:14,510 --> 00:25:13,140

mother betty was was remarked that it

548

00:25:16,730 --> 00:25:14,520

was the perfect rainbow they talked

549

00:25:19,850 --> 00:25:16,740

about it and then they went immediately

550

00:25:22,340 --> 00:25:19,860

up to heavens room and there Evan was

551
00:25:24,620 --> 00:25:22,350
sitting up so that was the time that he

552
00:25:26,570 --> 00:25:24,630
had recovered it just a little tidbit

553
00:25:28,280 --> 00:25:26,580
that you talk about in your article that

554
00:25:29,810 --> 00:25:28,290
I thought was great and it's real the

555
00:25:31,910 --> 00:25:29,820
real kind of journalism we would have

556
00:25:33,220 --> 00:25:31,920
liked to have gotten from Esquire is so

557
00:25:36,560 --> 00:25:33,230
you not only talked to these

558
00:25:39,169 --> 00:25:36,570
eyewitnesses which he did not he just

559
00:25:41,630 --> 00:25:39,179
went on some meteorological report but

560
00:25:43,580 --> 00:25:41,640
they also had evidence because it was

561
00:25:44,930 --> 00:25:43,590
such a spectacular event that they had

562
00:25:46,190 --> 00:25:44,940
written an email and I forget who

563
00:25:48,140 --> 00:25:46,200

whether it was his sister or whatever

564

00:25:50,030 --> 00:25:48,150

but they had email documentation that

565

00:25:51,200 --> 00:25:50,040

when they came way that day from the

566

00:25:52,910 --> 00:25:51,210

hospital they wrote someone an email

567

00:25:54,770 --> 00:25:52,920

said wow there's this great rainbow so I

568

00:25:57,980 --> 00:25:54,780

mean that's right so later later that

569

00:26:01,159 --> 00:25:57,990

day and so it said that she had written

570

00:26:02,600 --> 00:26:01,169

into the people she's in Boston and she

571

00:26:03,500 --> 00:26:02,610

had friends in Boston who were praying

572

00:26:06,830 --> 00:26:03,510

for Evan

573

00:26:10,570 --> 00:26:06,840

she had written them saying Evan has

574

00:26:14,030 --> 00:26:10,580

recovered and and we saw I saw a

575

00:26:14,890 --> 00:26:14,040

beautiful rainbow as I was coming into

576

00:26:19,100 --> 00:26:14,900

the hospital

577

00:26:21,380 --> 00:26:19,110

so that's so she said you know there's

578

00:26:25,580 --> 00:26:21,390

there's that documentation as well so

579

00:26:27,800 --> 00:26:25,590

the district's argument there is empty

580

00:26:29,660 --> 00:26:27,810

it's shoddy journalism if you're trying

581

00:26:31,370 --> 00:26:29,670

to debunk something which I've run

582

00:26:32,750 --> 00:26:31,380

across so many times that's one thing

583

00:26:35,600 --> 00:26:32,760

you're a deep bunker you're just out

584

00:26:37,100 --> 00:26:35,610

there you know just strolling whatever

585

00:26:39,980 --> 00:26:37,110

you can against the wall and seeing what

586

00:26:42,590 --> 00:26:39,990

sticks but if you're esquire who still

587

00:26:45,710 --> 00:26:42,600

has some kind of legitimacy as a

588

00:26:47,390 --> 00:26:45,720

journalistic enterprise you you have to

589

00:26:49,700 --> 00:26:47,400

do more than this you have to talk to

590

00:26:52,160 --> 00:26:49,710

witnesses you have to get their side of

591

00:26:54,260 --> 00:26:52,170

it I and and I think this lays a pattern

592

00:26:56,270 --> 00:26:54,270

for what we're about to what else we're

593

00:26:57,680 --> 00:26:56,280

about to talk about so the other point

594

00:27:01,280 --> 00:26:57,690

you make right after this in your

595

00:27:03,950 --> 00:27:01,290

article is this other fact that becomes

596

00:27:07,150 --> 00:27:03,960

controversial and that's dr. Alexander

597

00:27:09,980 --> 00:27:07,160

calls out oh my god and that becomes

598

00:27:12,710 --> 00:27:09,990

obviously an important part of the story

599

00:27:15,200 --> 00:27:12,720

Dietrich seeks to shoot that down tell

600

00:27:18,500 --> 00:27:15,210

us about that Robert Dittrich is saying

601
00:27:21,860 --> 00:27:18,510
that according to dr. powder he couldn't

602
00:27:23,720 --> 00:27:21,870
have yelled that out because and it was

603
00:27:26,330 --> 00:27:23,730
in the book it says right before he's

604
00:27:30,400 --> 00:27:26,340
leaving to being taken from the

605
00:27:34,160 --> 00:27:30,410
emergency room to the ICU he yelled out

606
00:27:35,690 --> 00:27:34,170
god help me and he couldn't have

607
00:27:37,670 --> 00:27:35,700
happened because he was intubated at

608
00:27:39,500 --> 00:27:37,680
that time and in fact he had been

609
00:27:44,390 --> 00:27:39,510
intubated for about an hour before he

610
00:27:46,790 --> 00:27:44,400
was taken up to NICU and so the that

611
00:27:50,690 --> 00:27:46,800
couldn't have happened well there were

612
00:27:54,560 --> 00:27:50,700
two witnesses Holly Alexander Evans wife

613
00:27:56,990 --> 00:27:54,570

and Michael Sullivan who was an

614

00:28:00,740 --> 00:27:57,000

Episcopal minister who is their neighbor

615

00:28:04,790 --> 00:28:00,750

and they were both in the ER at the time

616

00:28:06,590 --> 00:28:04,800

so I called Holly and said you know it

617

00:28:09,890 --> 00:28:06,600

took a while to get ahold of her and I

618

00:28:13,850 --> 00:28:09,900

had to have some help from Phyllis

619

00:28:16,760 --> 00:28:13,860

Phyllis but I talked with her and and

620

00:28:17,360 --> 00:28:16,770

she said yes he did say he did say that

621

00:28:19,220 --> 00:28:17,370

in fact

622

00:28:22,280 --> 00:28:19,230

we I was standing right outside the

623

00:28:23,960 --> 00:28:22,290

curtain they had they had said okay

624

00:28:27,410 --> 00:28:23,970

everybody out because we have to do this

625

00:28:30,049 --> 00:28:27,420

test you know this procedure and so they

626

00:28:34,930 --> 00:28:30,059

were standing outside she and mr.

627

00:28:38,180 --> 00:28:34,940

Sullivan and and and they both heard

628

00:28:40,040 --> 00:28:38,190

Evan say god help me as he was

629

00:28:41,900 --> 00:28:40,050

struggling with the people who were

630

00:28:47,600 --> 00:28:41,910

trying to do this procedure whatever it

631

00:28:50,030 --> 00:28:47,610

was and and and so they went to the

632

00:28:52,640 --> 00:28:50,040

bedside and and of course he was he was

633

00:28:59,210 --> 00:28:52,650

still struggling and was still

634

00:29:00,620 --> 00:28:59,220

unconscious so so there it is and of

635

00:29:04,220 --> 00:29:00,630

course that happened before the

636

00:29:06,260 --> 00:29:04,230

intubation so so the the embellishment

637

00:29:06,770 --> 00:29:06,270

that has happened here was for dramatic

638

00:29:09,799 --> 00:29:06,780

effect

639

00:29:12,530 --> 00:29:09,809

apparently that oh it had to be right

640

00:29:15,830 --> 00:29:12,540

before he's taken back to the ICU

641

00:29:18,740 --> 00:29:15,840

rather than sometime you know two hours

642

00:29:21,140 --> 00:29:18,750

before that in the ER right and this is

643

00:29:22,880 --> 00:29:21,150

a minor detail that you know who knows

644

00:29:24,290 --> 00:29:22,890

how it got in there or the editor or

645

00:29:26,030 --> 00:29:24,300

whatever it's it's really not important

646

00:29:28,880 --> 00:29:26,040

to that to the story and I can

647

00:29:31,610 --> 00:29:28,890

understand dr. Potter saying that if

648

00:29:33,830 --> 00:29:31,620

she's asked a certain way which she was

649

00:29:35,150 --> 00:29:33,840

let's get back to that story that part

650

00:29:38,419 --> 00:29:35,160

of the story because it's crucial

651
00:29:42,290 --> 00:29:38,429
crucial crucial it is really the point

652
00:29:44,540 --> 00:29:42,300
at which the whole article from Esquire

653
00:29:45,799 --> 00:29:44,550
shifts because he's kind of picking

654
00:29:47,540 --> 00:29:45,809
around at all these little things and

655
00:29:50,390 --> 00:29:47,550
then he hits you with hey wait a minute

656
00:29:52,580 --> 00:29:50,400
I talked to the ER physician and she has

657
00:29:56,210 --> 00:29:52,590
serious doubts about this guy's story

658
00:29:59,890 --> 00:29:56,220
that's the the meme that you get from

659
00:30:03,260 --> 00:29:59,900
Luke Dietrich is that Laura Potter is

660
00:30:05,120 --> 00:30:03,270
totally dissing this story and saying it

661
00:30:08,060 --> 00:30:05,130
couldn't have happened that way and he

662
00:30:10,400 --> 00:30:08,070
wasn't really in a coma and he was

663
00:30:12,200 --> 00:30:10,410

delirious and that's he makes the case

664

00:30:14,860 --> 00:30:12,210

that that's probably how this story all

665

00:30:17,480 --> 00:30:14,870

came about in this in this delirium that

666

00:30:18,830 --> 00:30:17,490

Alexander was having so why don't you

667

00:30:20,900 --> 00:30:18,840

pick up from there Robert because you

668

00:30:23,090 --> 00:30:20,910

said you've put a couple calls in to dr.

669

00:30:25,240 --> 00:30:23,100

Potter at this point in the story you

670

00:30:28,400 --> 00:30:25,250

haven't heard back what happens next I

671

00:30:30,440 --> 00:30:28,410

received from members of the family

672

00:30:30,950 --> 00:30:30,450

copies of emails that they had been

673

00:30:34,070 --> 00:30:30,960

sending

674

00:30:37,340 --> 00:30:34,080

back and forth and copies of portions

675

00:30:40,510 --> 00:30:37,350

just snippets of emails and in that was

676

00:30:43,430 --> 00:30:40,520

a statement that dr. Potter had made

677

00:30:46,190 --> 00:30:43,440

apparently I learned later it was a

678

00:30:50,570 --> 00:30:46,200

statement that she had issued to a press

679

00:30:52,820 --> 00:30:50,580

organization news organization and and

680

00:30:55,340 --> 00:30:52,830

apparently that news organization did

681

00:31:00,169 --> 00:30:55,350

not use it in any case that statement

682

00:31:04,610 --> 00:31:00,179

was that she was miss voted and taken

683

00:31:07,970 --> 00:31:04,620

out of context and so I said whoa this

684

00:31:11,139 --> 00:31:07,980

is really quite strange and that fact

685

00:31:13,549 --> 00:31:11,149

that she felt like her account was

686

00:31:16,070 --> 00:31:13,559

misrepresented that she was much more of

687

00:31:18,889 --> 00:31:16,080

supportive of Alexander story than it

688

00:31:22,070 --> 00:31:18,899

came out and that she felt like the

689

00:31:23,930 --> 00:31:22,080

questions weren't fair is backed up by

690

00:31:26,779 --> 00:31:23,940

what you heard from the family right

691

00:31:28,549 --> 00:31:26,789

because the family talks to dr. Potter

692

00:31:29,750 --> 00:31:28,559

and she's kind of like apologizing

693

00:31:32,330 --> 00:31:29,760

saying gosh I don't know how this

694

00:31:34,940 --> 00:31:32,340

happened and you know that's what I took

695

00:31:37,220 --> 00:31:34,950

away from your article is that what you

696

00:31:40,180 --> 00:31:37,230

got from talking to the family yes

697

00:31:44,389 --> 00:31:40,190

basically they said they repeated what

698

00:31:47,930 --> 00:31:44,399

dr. Potter had in this statement when

699

00:31:50,899 --> 00:31:47,940

when dr. Potter finally communicated to

700

00:31:54,740 --> 00:31:50,909

me through the public relations person

701
00:31:56,510 --> 00:31:54,750
at the hospital the public relations

702
00:31:59,240 --> 00:31:56,520
person said dr. Potter wants the

703
00:32:02,930 --> 00:31:59,250
statement that that I was quoting in the

704
00:32:05,930 --> 00:32:02,940
article removed I said fine dad was

705
00:32:08,570 --> 00:32:05,940
trying to you know I had contacted the

706
00:32:12,620 --> 00:32:08,580
public relations resident because dr.

707
00:32:14,539 --> 00:32:12,630
Potter hadn't responded yet and and I

708
00:32:17,960 --> 00:32:14,549
and and they didn't respond right away I

709
00:32:22,220 --> 00:32:17,970
had to call them three times and and

710
00:32:24,590 --> 00:32:22,230
finally Diane Reilly called me back and

711
00:32:26,830 --> 00:32:24,600
said she had talked with dr. Potter and

712
00:32:29,600 --> 00:32:26,840
dr. Potter doesn't want you to use that

713
00:32:32,360 --> 00:32:29,610

statement that she had doesn't want that

714

00:32:35,659 --> 00:32:32,370

quotation in there but she still made

715

00:32:37,850 --> 00:32:35,669

that statement and she did express that

716

00:32:40,100 --> 00:32:37,860

to the family and I think I want to make

717

00:32:43,410 --> 00:32:40,110

it crystal clear here that we put the

718

00:32:45,900 --> 00:32:43,420

responsibility where it belongs in

719

00:32:48,960 --> 00:32:45,910

where you put it in your article and

720

00:32:51,630 --> 00:32:48,970

that is for Luke Dietrich who went out

721

00:32:56,160 --> 00:32:51,640

there with this piece of work that he

722

00:32:59,070 --> 00:32:56,170

did to back up his claims you don't talk

723

00:33:01,200 --> 00:32:59,080

to one person and then misrepresent him

724

00:33:03,570 --> 00:33:01,210

and not go back and say hey is this

725

00:33:07,890 --> 00:33:03,580

really what you said you don't go and

726

00:33:11,370 --> 00:33:07,900

not talk to the lead physician dr. Scott

727

00:33:14,190 --> 00:33:11,380

Wade who still stands by his report that

728

00:33:16,230 --> 00:33:14,200

there is no way this guy could have had

729

00:33:18,990 --> 00:33:16,240

a functioning brain and that the coma

730

00:33:22,500 --> 00:33:19,000

lasted virtually from the time that this

731

00:33:25,550 --> 00:33:22,510

thing onset till he was out the the

732

00:33:28,710 --> 00:33:25,560

responsibility for this is squarely on

733

00:33:31,530 --> 00:33:28,720

Esquire and as you point out I think it

734

00:33:33,900 --> 00:33:31,540

was you said it hey at the very least if

735

00:33:36,150 --> 00:33:33,910

you're Luke Dietrich and you think maybe

736

00:33:37,860 --> 00:33:36,160

you just made this little mistake by

737

00:33:40,560 --> 00:33:37,870

accident great publish your notes

738

00:33:43,140 --> 00:33:40,570

publish your recordings with the doctor

739

00:33:46,260 --> 00:33:43,150

with dr. Laura Potter show us that you

740

00:33:49,470 --> 00:33:46,270

didn't twist this into a story to fit

741

00:33:51,120 --> 00:33:49,480

your predetermined goal because all the

742

00:33:53,550 --> 00:33:51,130

other facts that you're bringing up

743

00:33:55,950 --> 00:33:53,560

would really paint that as the true

744

00:33:59,400 --> 00:33:55,960

story of what's going on here right and

745

00:34:02,460 --> 00:33:59,410

basically dr. Potter expressed to the

746

00:34:05,160 --> 00:34:02,470

family that she had been misrepresented

747

00:34:09,330 --> 00:34:05,170

and that her words were taken out of

748

00:34:12,630 --> 00:34:09,340

context by Luke Dietrich and that he had

749

00:34:15,720 --> 00:34:12,640

led her to say certain things and in

750

00:34:19,409 --> 00:34:15,730

fact it was a little more than that they

751
00:34:21,570 --> 00:34:19,419
said that he had that she had expressed

752
00:34:23,460 --> 00:34:21,580
to them that he had forced her to say

753
00:34:25,409 --> 00:34:23,470
certain things I didn't hear that from

754
00:34:31,230 --> 00:34:25,419
dr. Potter but that's what they say to

755
00:34:34,860 --> 00:34:31,240
me it is as if he was leading her in in

756
00:34:37,740 --> 00:34:34,870
a way that she had to come out and say

757
00:34:43,020 --> 00:34:37,750
yes conscious but delirious but that

758
00:34:45,350 --> 00:34:43,030
isn't really what is applying to to evan

759
00:34:52,080 --> 00:34:45,360
Alexander's case at least that's my

760
00:34:56,100 --> 00:34:52,090
guess and and that indeed he was in a

761
00:34:57,609 --> 00:34:56,110
coma and the course the the question

762
00:35:00,010 --> 00:34:57,619
that Luke

763
00:35:01,720 --> 00:35:00,020

says he posed to her I don't think is

764

00:35:04,210 --> 00:35:01,730

the question he actually posed to her

765

00:35:06,430 --> 00:35:04,220

when she said yes conscious but

766

00:35:09,700 --> 00:35:06,440

delirious it would be very interesting

767

00:35:14,280 --> 00:35:09,710

to see what exactly happened in that

768

00:35:17,500 --> 00:35:14,290

interview and and and just understand

769

00:35:18,940 --> 00:35:17,510

what she was responding to I think it

770

00:35:23,109 --> 00:35:18,950

would be more than interesting I think

771

00:35:25,750 --> 00:35:23,119

it's absolutely his responsibility given

772

00:35:27,299 --> 00:35:25,760

the damage that this article has done

773

00:35:29,799 --> 00:35:27,309

and sought to do from the beginning

774

00:35:32,230 --> 00:35:29,809

there's an added level of response

775

00:35:34,329 --> 00:35:32,240

journalistic responsibility to get your

776

00:35:35,770 --> 00:35:34,339

facts right and these things being

777

00:35:40,440 --> 00:35:35,780

called into question this way

778

00:35:43,539 --> 00:35:40,450

demand that he really back up his claims

779

00:35:46,240 --> 00:35:43,549

yes it's very interesting dr. Potter

780

00:35:48,370 --> 00:35:46,250

doesn't want to be you know involved in

781

00:35:51,130 --> 00:35:48,380

this anymore she wants to you know let

782

00:35:53,289 --> 00:35:51,140

it go we have to respect that so you we

783

00:35:56,650 --> 00:35:53,299

can't we can't go back to dr. Potter but

784

00:35:58,630 --> 00:35:56,660

we can you know if if if sooth Dietrich

785

00:36:01,780 --> 00:35:58,640

did record this it would be interesting

786

00:36:04,359 --> 00:36:01,790

for the Esquire editors to look at what

787

00:36:07,900 --> 00:36:04,369

exactly is said and and maybe make that

788

00:36:09,579 --> 00:36:07,910

available and and and and what you know

789

00:36:13,780 --> 00:36:09,589

what was the conversation that he had

790

00:36:17,230 --> 00:36:13,790

where dr. Potter said yes conscious but

791

00:36:20,799 --> 00:36:17,240

delirious because on that hinges

792

00:36:24,940 --> 00:36:20,809

everything of his claim that he wasn't

793

00:36:27,579 --> 00:36:24,950

in a bacterial meningitis induced coma

794

00:36:30,359 --> 00:36:27,589

he was in a medically induced coma that

795

00:36:32,859 --> 00:36:30,369

they brought him out of periodically

796

00:36:36,010 --> 00:36:32,869

because and of course he was flashing

797

00:36:37,839 --> 00:36:36,020

around conscious quote conscious but

798

00:36:39,970 --> 00:36:37,849

delirious and then they would put

799

00:36:41,829 --> 00:36:39,980

because he was flashing around he would

800

00:36:44,260 --> 00:36:41,839

be put back into the command to

801
00:36:47,799 --> 00:36:44,270
medically induced coma no he was he was

802
00:36:51,960 --> 00:36:47,809
out the whole time well that that whole

803
00:36:54,220 --> 00:36:51,970
scenario makes for an extremely terrible

804
00:36:56,079 --> 00:36:54,230
explanation for this near-death

805
00:36:57,700 --> 00:36:56,089
experience and it goes back to the very

806
00:36:59,950 --> 00:36:57,710
first thing you said here Robert and

807
00:37:01,930 --> 00:36:59,960
that's that we've seen this if you've

808
00:37:04,150 --> 00:37:01,940
been around this field for a long time

809
00:37:06,520 --> 00:37:04,160
you've seen this over and over again

810
00:37:08,559 --> 00:37:06,530
it's the divide-and-conquer oh I can

811
00:37:10,800 --> 00:37:08,569
explain that near-death experience this

812
00:37:12,600 --> 00:37:10,810
way oh I can explain that near

813
00:37:14,610 --> 00:37:12,610

experience a completely different way

814

00:37:16,380 --> 00:37:14,620

that contradicts the first way but now

815

00:37:18,630 --> 00:37:16,390

I've handled that one and now I've

816

00:37:21,380 --> 00:37:18,640

handled this one the point is and I

817

00:37:25,350 --> 00:37:21,390

think when we talk about we use words

818

00:37:26,640 --> 00:37:25,360

carefully chosen to kind of push people

819

00:37:27,480 --> 00:37:26,650

in a certain way and we say what's he

820

00:37:29,880 --> 00:37:27,490

conscious

821

00:37:32,420 --> 00:37:29,890

was he delirious and I think when you

822

00:37:34,710 --> 00:37:32,430

read the more medically oriented

823

00:37:38,040 --> 00:37:34,720

explanations to this case what they show

824

00:37:40,230 --> 00:37:38,050

is hey there is no way on earth this guy

825

00:37:42,840 --> 00:37:40,240

should be having these kind of

826

00:37:44,910 --> 00:37:42,850

experiences that he reported given his

827

00:37:47,880 --> 00:37:44,920

medical condition you want to talk about

828

00:37:51,060 --> 00:37:47,890

it coma conscious delirious whatever his

829

00:37:53,130 --> 00:37:51,070

brain was gone man there was as he said

830

00:37:55,860 --> 00:37:53,140

as dr. Alexander said in that piece that

831

00:37:57,740 --> 00:37:55,870

I wrote you there is no possible way

832

00:38:00,270 --> 00:37:57,750

that there could have been any

833

00:38:03,090 --> 00:38:00,280

significant mental processing brain

834

00:38:04,590 --> 00:38:03,100

processing going on when that brain

835

00:38:07,020 --> 00:38:04,600

state was that so I think it's

836

00:38:08,930 --> 00:38:07,030

disingenuous to kind of when these guys

837

00:38:11,160 --> 00:38:08,940

throw around these terms and try and

838

00:38:13,590 --> 00:38:11,170

wordsmith it here or there pick the

839

00:38:16,020 --> 00:38:13,600

words apart the guy had a severely

840

00:38:17,580 --> 00:38:16,030

severely compromised brain that isn't

841

00:38:22,020 --> 00:38:17,590

even controversial why isn't that the

842

00:38:24,810 --> 00:38:22,030

focus right and I go into in my article

843

00:38:26,610 --> 00:38:24,820

go into talking about coma and seizures

844

00:38:28,140 --> 00:38:26,620

he was having seizures and that and

845

00:38:30,240 --> 00:38:28,150

that's that's why he was thrashing

846

00:38:33,510 --> 00:38:30,250

around because the electrical activity

847

00:38:36,200 --> 00:38:33,520

in his brain being under attack from the

848

00:38:41,880 --> 00:38:36,210

bacteria on the surface of the cortex

849

00:38:45,420 --> 00:38:41,890

was causing all kinds of random showers

850

00:38:48,240 --> 00:38:45,430

of electrical activity that would cause

851
00:38:51,480 --> 00:38:48,250
muscle movements random muscle movements

852
00:38:54,270 --> 00:38:51,490
and and could cause vocalizations and so

853
00:38:56,730 --> 00:38:54,280
on and and that's what was observed also

854
00:39:00,030 --> 00:38:56,740
the other aspects of his coma

855
00:39:02,720 --> 00:39:00,040
were measured and and he was he had

856
00:39:07,080 --> 00:39:02,730
severe brain damage from the beginning

857
00:39:10,380 --> 00:39:07,090
he was in the Glasgow Coma Scale of

858
00:39:13,860 --> 00:39:10,390
eight indicating severe brain damage and

859
00:39:16,560 --> 00:39:13,870
not responses maybe responses if you is

860
00:39:19,020 --> 00:39:16,570
to a painful stimulus but not responsive

861
00:39:24,059 --> 00:39:19,030
you know to talking not being verbal at

862
00:39:26,339 --> 00:39:24,069
all being unconscious and an end as

863
00:39:29,609 --> 00:39:26,349

as the day's wore on it got worse and

864

00:39:32,789 --> 00:39:29,619

worse and and towards the end his hands

865

00:39:35,459 --> 00:39:32,799

were curling up and his feet were toes

866

00:39:39,269 --> 00:39:35,469

were curling up and that's indicating

867

00:39:41,130 --> 00:39:39,279

even further into coma so to say well he

868

00:39:44,640 --> 00:39:41,140

was conscious when he was brought out of

869

00:39:46,739 --> 00:39:44,650

sedation or but just delirious is just

870

00:39:49,469 --> 00:39:46,749

completely wrong you know and we may

871

00:39:52,170 --> 00:39:49,479

never be able to get to the bottom of

872

00:39:54,059 --> 00:39:52,180

this these medical records are very hard

873

00:39:56,430 --> 00:39:54,069

to get your hands on there's privacy

874

00:39:58,199 --> 00:39:56,440

issues there's all sorts of medical

875

00:40:01,620 --> 00:39:58,209

liability issues and those kind of

876

00:40:03,809 --> 00:40:01,630

things but one final point on your

877

00:40:06,870 --> 00:40:03,819

article that we can wrap our arms around

878

00:40:10,799 --> 00:40:06,880

because it's very public is Dietrich's

879

00:40:14,519 --> 00:40:10,809

spin on Evan Alexander's encounter with

880

00:40:19,170 --> 00:40:14,529

the Dalai Lama and for anyone who really

881

00:40:21,390 --> 00:40:19,180

wants a fact-based analysis of how

882

00:40:25,829 --> 00:40:21,400

straight this guy is shooting with you

883

00:40:27,749 --> 00:40:25,839

can go watch dr. Alexander's joint

884

00:40:30,299 --> 00:40:27,759

presentation with the Dalai Lama

885

00:40:33,209 --> 00:40:30,309

so Dietrich really adds that as the

886

00:40:36,150 --> 00:40:33,219

capstone kicker to his article and you

887

00:40:38,339 --> 00:40:36,160

cover it at the end of yours tell us

888

00:40:41,459 --> 00:40:38,349

what you found out in that case Robert

889

00:40:44,039 --> 00:40:41,469

well the district took the words of the

890

00:40:46,079 --> 00:40:44,049

Dalai Lama and twisted them to mean

891

00:40:51,870 --> 00:40:46,089

exactly the opposite of what the Dalai

892

00:40:56,789 --> 00:40:51,880

Lama meant and and not only that but

893

00:41:00,359 --> 00:40:56,799

this was emblazoned in the article in a

894

00:41:03,329 --> 00:41:00,369

pull quote all caps the Dalai Lama wags

895

00:41:06,749 --> 00:41:03,339

a finger at Alexander women and says

896

00:41:09,420 --> 00:41:06,759

when a man makes extraordinary claims a

897

00:41:11,910 --> 00:41:09,430

thorough investigation is required to

898

00:41:13,949 --> 00:41:11,920

ensure that person is reliable has no

899

00:41:15,900 --> 00:41:13,959

reason to lie you know what I thought

900

00:41:19,559 --> 00:41:15,910

was it what struck me immediately is as

901
00:41:22,079 --> 00:41:19,569
if Dietrich is signing on to this idea

902
00:41:25,019 --> 00:41:22,089
that the Dalai Lama has some psychic

903
00:41:27,209 --> 00:41:25,029
powers and is reading the soul of even

904
00:41:29,189 --> 00:41:27,219
Alexander and is telling this great

905
00:41:32,579 --> 00:41:29,199
deceit that he's holding on his soul I

906
00:41:34,259 --> 00:41:32,589
mean otherwise well how would he how is

907
00:41:37,920 --> 00:41:34,269
even suggesting that the Dalai Lama

908
00:41:40,440 --> 00:41:37,930
would would know what he's suggesting he

909
00:41:42,540 --> 00:41:40,450
saying which of course gets to the heart

910
00:41:44,849 --> 00:41:42,550
of the issue which is that's not at all

911
00:41:46,799 --> 00:41:44,859
what the Dalai Lama was saying and the

912
00:41:49,410 --> 00:41:46,809
whole purpose of that presentation was

913
00:41:51,000 --> 00:41:49,420

exactly the opposite of what we're led

914

00:41:52,530 --> 00:41:51,010

to believe in the Esquire article so

915

00:41:56,339 --> 00:41:52,540

please elaborate on them

916

00:41:59,190 --> 00:41:56,349

well the Dalai Lama heard Evan

917

00:42:01,950 --> 00:41:59,200

Alexander's presentation and the first

918

00:42:03,390 --> 00:42:01,960

thing that he said was your explanation

919

00:42:06,960 --> 00:42:03,400

on the basis for your own sort of

920

00:42:10,440 --> 00:42:06,970

experience quite and then he said of

921

00:42:12,540 --> 00:42:10,450

that word quite Tibetan word amazing

922

00:42:14,970 --> 00:42:12,550

quite amazing and if you look at the if

923

00:42:17,250 --> 00:42:14,980

you look at the video the Dalai Lama has

924

00:42:20,490 --> 00:42:17,260

an expression where he is really quite

925

00:42:22,349 --> 00:42:20,500

amazed and that's at the very beginning

926

00:42:25,890 --> 00:42:22,359

that's the first thing he says so that

927

00:42:28,200 --> 00:42:25,900

kind of tells you well he's not he's not

928

00:42:30,329 --> 00:42:28,210

doing he's not making the judgement that

929

00:42:32,910 --> 00:42:30,339

the district is saying he's making and

930

00:42:36,059 --> 00:42:32,920

the Dalai Lama then explains something

931

00:42:38,849 --> 00:42:36,069

about how you can have evident phenomena

932

00:42:42,270 --> 00:42:38,859

you can have hidden phenomena that you

933

00:42:44,099 --> 00:42:42,280

can infer from measurements in direct

934

00:42:47,130 --> 00:42:44,109

measurements and you can have extremely

935

00:42:49,620 --> 00:42:47,140

hidden phenomena and let me just

936

00:42:51,839 --> 00:42:49,630

interject one more time because if you

937

00:42:53,730 --> 00:42:51,849

really if someone really listens to the

938

00:42:56,940 --> 00:42:53,740

entire presentation by the Dalai Lama

939

00:42:59,670 --> 00:42:56,950

and also puts it in the context of his

940

00:43:01,500 --> 00:42:59,680

previous presentations we should be it

941

00:43:05,339 --> 00:43:01,510

should be crystal clear what he's saying

942

00:43:07,559 --> 00:43:05,349

there he's doing a call to science to

943

00:43:10,260 --> 00:43:07,569

investigate consciousness and

944

00:43:12,839 --> 00:43:10,270

investigate these phenomena he is

945

00:43:15,960 --> 00:43:12,849

calling out science in exactly the

946

00:43:17,880 --> 00:43:15,970

opposite way that deitrick is talking

947

00:43:19,770 --> 00:43:17,890

about he's saying hey get in this game

948

00:43:22,650 --> 00:43:19,780

there's a lot to be investigated here

949

00:43:25,859 --> 00:43:22,660

like this guy has investigated and his

950

00:43:28,140 --> 00:43:25,869

is just one way to investigate it right

951
00:43:31,559 --> 00:43:28,150
and and so he's saying that with these

952
00:43:34,740 --> 00:43:31,569
extremely hidden phenomena where you

953
00:43:37,520 --> 00:43:34,750
cannot investigate them directly or even

954
00:43:40,589 --> 00:43:37,530
indirectly through scientific means

955
00:43:46,730 --> 00:43:40,599
normal scientific means then you have to

956
00:43:49,859 --> 00:43:46,740
rely on the testimony of a person who is

957
00:43:51,870 --> 00:43:49,869
has the testimony who had experienced

958
00:43:53,309 --> 00:43:51,880
this but you have to be careful

959
00:43:55,440 --> 00:43:53,319
you have to have a thorough

960
00:43:57,509 --> 00:43:55,450
investigation you have to be sure that

961
00:44:02,339 --> 00:43:57,519
the person is reliable and it's not

962
00:44:04,289 --> 00:44:02,349
never telling lie and and and then you

963
00:44:08,400 --> 00:44:04,299

can take the testimony to be credible

964

00:44:10,170 --> 00:44:08,410

and what Luke Dietrich left out was the

965

00:44:13,440 --> 00:44:10,180

Dalai Lama said and I'm quoting him here

966

00:44:16,980 --> 00:44:13,450

through then thorough investigation that

967

00:44:19,589 --> 00:44:16,990

person is reliable never telling lie and

968

00:44:22,950 --> 00:44:19,599

in this particular case this is no

969

00:44:25,140 --> 00:44:22,960

reason to tell lie therefore and then

970

00:44:29,339 --> 00:44:25,150

the translator says so then one can take

971

00:44:31,289 --> 00:44:29,349

the testimony to be credible and the

972

00:44:33,390 --> 00:44:31,299

district left out that and in this

973

00:44:36,299 --> 00:44:33,400

particular case this is no reason to

974

00:44:37,620 --> 00:44:36,309

tell lie so he's saying and in this

975

00:44:40,499 --> 00:44:37,630

particular case

976
00:44:45,150 --> 00:44:40,509
Evan Alexander there is no reason to

977
00:44:48,180 --> 00:44:45,160
tell a lie and and the district's turns

978
00:44:50,609 --> 00:44:48,190
that around and says you know that

979
00:44:55,190 --> 00:44:50,619
person is reliable never telling lie and

980
00:44:58,890 --> 00:44:55,200
has no reason to lie but leaves out that

981
00:45:01,259 --> 00:44:58,900
the Dalai Lama is saying in this

982
00:45:03,930 --> 00:45:01,269
particular case if an Alexander has no

983
00:45:06,690 --> 00:45:03,940
reason to lie right I mean obviously

984
00:45:08,940 --> 00:45:06,700
what he's talking about is again he's

985
00:45:10,980 --> 00:45:08,950
trying to lay the the cookie crumbs for

986
00:45:12,240 --> 00:45:10,990
science in terms of all investigated

987
00:45:14,190 --> 00:45:12,250
what you're saying why should a

988
00:45:16,440 --> 00:45:14,200

spiritual leader be doing that but on

989

00:45:18,480 --> 00:45:16,450

the other hand why hasn't science done a

990

00:45:20,789 --> 00:45:18,490

better job of that so I think he feels

991

00:45:23,039 --> 00:45:20,799

motivated to do this and I think what

992

00:45:25,170 --> 00:45:23,049

he's really contrasting is somebody who

993

00:45:26,579 --> 00:45:25,180

just walks in off the street and writes

994

00:45:29,279 --> 00:45:26,589

a story about a near-death experience

995

00:45:32,099 --> 00:45:29,289

they had 20 years ago we have no way of

996

00:45:33,960 --> 00:45:32,109

knowing verses in this case we have tons

997

00:45:36,749 --> 00:45:33,970

of evidence that guy was in the hospital

998

00:45:39,539 --> 00:45:36,759

we have all these medical records I

999

00:45:41,220 --> 00:45:39,549

think as you just pointed out I think

1000

00:45:43,380 --> 00:45:41,230

that's what the Dalai Lama is alluding

1001
00:45:45,329 --> 00:45:43,390
to he's saying hey in this case we have

1002
00:45:46,799 --> 00:45:45,339
all this evidence we know this guy is

1003
00:45:49,769 --> 00:45:46,809
telling the truth about his medical

1004
00:45:52,289 --> 00:45:49,779
condition right but also that we can

1005
00:45:54,960 --> 00:45:52,299
rely on his testimony that is to say

1006
00:45:58,079 --> 00:45:54,970
what he experienced in in this

1007
00:46:00,720 --> 00:45:58,089
transcendent kind of experience that's

1008
00:46:02,819 --> 00:46:00,730
reliable that's credible right and that

1009
00:46:05,350 --> 00:46:02,829
that you need to take that and and by

1010
00:46:11,260 --> 00:46:05,360
the way this is exactly what we

1011
00:46:13,690 --> 00:46:11,270
we promote as well that we you know that

1012
00:46:15,970 --> 00:46:13,700
the evidence even in the transcendent

1013
00:46:18,910 --> 00:46:15,980

aspects of near-death experiences is

1014

00:46:23,830 --> 00:46:18,920

valid and and actually there's the

1015

00:46:26,470 --> 00:46:23,840

vertical evidence there as well that can

1016

00:46:30,070 --> 00:46:26,480

be traced back to you know facts on the

1017

00:46:32,590 --> 00:46:30,080

ground facts on the earth and so the the

1018

00:46:35,650 --> 00:46:32,600

data Lama is is saying that for these

1019

00:46:37,300 --> 00:46:35,660

these experiences we have to be sure

1020

00:46:40,180 --> 00:46:37,310

that we're talking to somebody who's not

1021

00:46:43,900 --> 00:46:40,190

making it up but then we can then we

1022

00:46:48,070 --> 00:46:43,910

need to study that exactly so Robert

1023

00:46:50,080 --> 00:46:48,080

what has been the reaction so far to the

1024

00:46:55,120 --> 00:46:50,090

article you've published on the ions

1025

00:46:58,540 --> 00:46:55,130

website uh not not very much there's

1026

00:47:01,570 --> 00:46:58,550

been a number of well several people who

1027

00:47:04,950 --> 00:47:01,580

have written blogs that say yes this is

1028

00:47:08,770 --> 00:47:04,960

you know certainly certainly destroying

1029

00:47:11,020 --> 00:47:08,780

the district's credibility but there has

1030

00:47:16,600 --> 00:47:11,030

been no contact enquiries from the press

1031

00:47:18,280 --> 00:47:16,610

I've sent out a few few emails to people

1032

00:47:21,820 --> 00:47:18,290

who have written articles about the

1033

00:47:23,800 --> 00:47:21,830

district's article and no response

1034

00:47:27,490 --> 00:47:23,810

right that's to be expected I should

1035

00:47:31,180 --> 00:47:27,500

mention that I did try to contact both

1036

00:47:34,150 --> 00:47:31,190

the editor of Esquire David Granger and

1037

00:47:36,850 --> 00:47:34,160

Luke Detrick Luke Detrick got back to me

1038

00:47:39,850 --> 00:47:36,860

with a very quick email saying that he

1039

00:47:41,530 --> 00:47:39,860

respectfully declined the interview to

1040

00:47:43,240 --> 00:47:41,540

which I said well great what that you

1041

00:47:46,690 --> 00:47:43,250

know no problem why don't I just send

1042

00:47:49,660 --> 00:47:46,700

you five or six questions and you can do

1043

00:47:51,730 --> 00:47:49,670

an email response and I've yet to hear

1044

00:47:54,970 --> 00:47:51,740

from a man I never will never will hear

1045

00:47:56,260 --> 00:47:54,980

from him Manette so I think this is also

1046

00:47:58,750 --> 00:47:56,270

you know you talked at the very

1047

00:48:00,940 --> 00:47:58,760

beginning Robert about this pattern that

1048

00:48:03,160 --> 00:48:00,950

we see over and over again and what are

1049

00:48:05,680 --> 00:48:03,170

the patterns is you know attack the

1050

00:48:08,410 --> 00:48:05,690

individual attack the individual cases

1051

00:48:10,990 --> 00:48:08,420

don't ever look at the research as a

1052

00:48:13,410 --> 00:48:11,000

whole don't ever look at you know when

1053

00:48:16,960 --> 00:48:13,420

Jeff long comes out dr. Jeff long and

1054

00:48:18,790 --> 00:48:16,970

compiles hundreds and hundreds of these

1055

00:48:21,130 --> 00:48:18,800

cases and does statistical and

1056

00:48:23,500 --> 00:48:21,140

I don't talk clap too much it's gonna be

1057

00:48:26,340 --> 00:48:23,510

kind of hard to hit on hundreds of cases

1058

00:48:27,940 --> 00:48:26,350

instead just try and knock down these

1059

00:48:30,880 --> 00:48:27,950

individual cases

1060

00:48:34,360 --> 00:48:30,890

well another strategy I think is get the

1061

00:48:37,090 --> 00:48:34,370

story out there and then never respond

1062

00:48:39,550 --> 00:48:37,100

because the follow-up story never gets

1063

00:48:43,300 --> 00:48:39,560

the traction that the first story gets

1064

00:48:45,940 --> 00:48:43,310

right but in a way if the skeptics have

1065

00:48:47,860 --> 00:48:45,950

got their catchphrase about Evan

1066

00:48:51,070 --> 00:48:47,870

Alexander now and whenever that

1067

00:48:54,580 --> 00:48:51,080

catchphrase is brought up then my

1068

00:48:57,010 --> 00:48:54,590

article can be used as a counter at

1069

00:49:00,850 --> 00:48:57,020

least there's that and hopefully people

1070

00:49:02,530 --> 00:49:00,860

who really want to investigate and

1071

00:49:04,660 --> 00:49:02,540

really do want to nudge a little bit

1072

00:49:07,750 --> 00:49:04,670

closer to the truth whatever that means

1073

00:49:11,020 --> 00:49:07,760

to them can follow the path because it's

1074

00:49:13,090 --> 00:49:11,030

really not up to us or anyone else to

1075

00:49:16,540 --> 00:49:13,100

convince someone or try and win them

1076
00:49:18,310 --> 00:49:16,550
over all we can do or lay the data out

1077
00:49:20,550 --> 00:49:18,320
there and let people have their own

1078
00:49:22,990 --> 00:49:20,560
journey through it and to that extent

1079
00:49:26,560 --> 00:49:23,000
you and Suzanne have done a great

1080
00:49:28,840 --> 00:49:26,570
service I think in both upping the ante

1081
00:49:32,380 --> 00:49:28,850
internal in terms of journalistic

1082
00:49:34,690 --> 00:49:32,390
integrity and maybe exposing the larger

1083
00:49:38,320 --> 00:49:34,700
picture of what's going on with this

1084
00:49:40,600 --> 00:49:38,330
culture war battle about consciousness

1085
00:49:42,070 --> 00:49:40,610
and survival of consciousness which is

1086
00:49:42,550 --> 00:49:42,080
really what's at the heart of this whole

1087
00:49:45,220 --> 00:49:42,560
thing

1088
00:49:47,320 --> 00:49:45,230

well great work thanks again so much for

1089

00:49:49,240 --> 00:49:47,330

this article we'll be sure to post it

1090

00:49:51,700 --> 00:49:49,250

along with a link to your excellent

1091

00:49:54,610 --> 00:49:51,710

website where people can check out many

1092

00:49:55,780 --> 00:49:54,620

of your other interesting presentations

1093

00:49:57,880 --> 00:49:55,790

you have some great You Tube

1094

00:50:00,250 --> 00:49:57,890

presentations that you've done as well

1095

00:50:02,380 --> 00:50:00,260

as the writing that you and Suzanne have

1096

00:50:04,390 --> 00:50:02,390

done so we'll be sure to mention that is

1097

00:50:09,010 --> 00:50:04,400

there anything else we should mention

1098

00:50:11,320 --> 00:50:09,020

well no other than that I'm planning Jen

1099

00:50:14,260 --> 00:50:11,330

and I are going to be presenting a

1100

00:50:16,690 --> 00:50:14,270

workshop at the ions conference in a

1101

00:50:18,970 --> 00:50:16,700

week where is that at that's in

1102

00:50:23,740 --> 00:50:18,980

Arlington Virginia at the sheriff in

1103

00:50:27,310 --> 00:50:23,750

Crystal City hotel and on August 30th

1104

00:50:28,870 --> 00:50:27,320

and we're talking about the the solving

1105

00:50:30,970 --> 00:50:28,880

the mystery of consciousness through

1106

00:50:32,170 --> 00:50:30,980

near-death experiences and and we're

1107

00:50:34,599 --> 00:50:32,180

hoping that and we

1108

00:50:37,109 --> 00:50:34,609

have another researcher Kenny Arnett who

1109

00:50:41,049 --> 00:50:37,119

is going to be presenting with us and

1110

00:50:43,630 --> 00:50:41,059

we're hoping maybe that at an Alexander

1111

00:50:47,710 --> 00:50:43,640

who will be at the conference will at

1112

00:50:50,770 --> 00:50:47,720

least come in and join the discussion if

1113

00:50:52,690 --> 00:50:50,780

not actually to present part of it we've

1114

00:50:56,049 --> 00:50:52,700

asked him that and hopefully he can do

1115

00:50:58,780 --> 00:50:56,059

that in any case yeah that's if

1116

00:51:01,660 --> 00:50:58,790

anybody's interested in that they can

1117

00:51:04,599 --> 00:51:01,670

get the information on the ions website

1118

00:51:07,120 --> 00:51:04,609

i answ org well great and we'll try and

1119

00:51:09,099 --> 00:51:07,130

link people up to that as well Robert

1120

00:51:11,470 --> 00:51:09,109

well it's been great talking to you and

1121

00:51:13,720 --> 00:51:11,480

again congratulations on this excellent

1122

00:51:15,640 --> 00:51:13,730

work that you've done thanks again so

1123

00:51:17,859 --> 00:51:15,650

much for joining me today yeah thank you

1124

00:51:20,170 --> 00:51:17,869

for having us thanks again to Robert for

1125

00:51:22,510 --> 00:51:20,180

joining me on skeptic oh and thanks of

1126
00:51:24,250 --> 00:51:22,520
course to both Robert and Suzanne for

1127
00:51:25,750 --> 00:51:24,260
spending their time and applying their

1128
00:51:28,120 --> 00:51:25,760
talents to doing this kind of

1129
00:51:29,620 --> 00:51:28,130
investigation you know again folks step

1130
00:51:32,140 --> 00:51:29,630
back these people aren't paid they're

1131
00:51:34,240 --> 00:51:32,150
not not receiving any financial gain for

1132
00:51:35,410 --> 00:51:34,250
for doing all this they're doing it

1133
00:51:37,690 --> 00:51:35,420
because they have an interest in

1134
00:51:40,809 --> 00:51:37,700
pursuing the truth and that is indeed

1135
00:51:42,910 --> 00:51:40,819
admirable one question to tee up from

1136
00:51:46,420 --> 00:51:42,920
this interview and it's the obvious one

1137
00:51:48,700 --> 00:51:46,430
what drives this information war with

1138
00:51:51,069 --> 00:51:48,710

regard to near-death experience science

1139

00:51:52,569 --> 00:51:51,079

because it's really a one-sided war I

1140

00:51:54,579 --> 00:51:52,579

mean there's a lot of information

1141

00:51:57,190 --> 00:51:54,589

Moore's out there there's a lot of

1142

00:51:58,660 --> 00:51:57,200

culture bowels or around different areas

1143

00:52:00,490 --> 00:51:58,670

of science

1144

00:52:03,069 --> 00:52:00,500

there's evolution and intelligent design

1145

00:52:04,690 --> 00:52:03,079

there's climate science debates there's

1146

00:52:07,240 --> 00:52:04,700

all sorts of debates around science and

1147

00:52:09,069 --> 00:52:07,250

they often have two different sides two

1148

00:52:11,650 --> 00:52:09,079

different forces that are driving them

1149

00:52:14,049 --> 00:52:11,660

in this there's really only one force

1150

00:52:16,289 --> 00:52:14,059

and that's the anti near-death

1151
00:52:19,000 --> 00:52:16,299
experience science people the near-death

1152
00:52:22,120 --> 00:52:19,010
experience science people aren't driven

1153
00:52:24,160 --> 00:52:22,130
by some political or religious group or

1154
00:52:26,740 --> 00:52:24,170
some agenda they're just people that

1155
00:52:29,349 --> 00:52:26,750
have pursued an interesting phenomenon

1156
00:52:31,839 --> 00:52:29,359
this has huge implications for defining

1157
00:52:34,089 --> 00:52:31,849
who we are let's pursue it it's really

1158
00:52:35,500 --> 00:52:34,099
unique I think in that way if you look

1159
00:52:37,030 --> 00:52:35,510
at it of course you might feel

1160
00:52:38,770 --> 00:52:37,040
differently about that in which case

1161
00:52:41,260 --> 00:52:38,780
that's another reason to answer this

1162
00:52:43,270 --> 00:52:41,270
question and explain why you do see it

1163
00:52:46,030 --> 00:52:43,280

differently if of course the place to

1164

00:52:48,540 --> 00:52:46,040

answer this question to engage in this

1165

00:52:53,740 --> 00:52:48,550

dialog is through the skeptic Oh website

1166

00:52:56,050 --> 00:52:53,750

@sk EP tik Oh calm there you can leave a

1167

00:52:58,090 --> 00:52:56,060

comment right on the website or click on

1168

00:53:00,160 --> 00:52:58,100

over to the forum and join the

1169

00:53:02,170 --> 00:53:00,170

discussion over there of course you can

1170

00:53:04,630 --> 00:53:02,180

drop me an email or connect with me on

1171

00:53:06,040 --> 00:53:04,640

Facebook as well well that's going to do

1172

00:53:09,130 --> 00:53:06,050

it for this episode a number of

1173

00:53:11,770 --> 00:53:09,140

interesting shows coming up we have one

1174

00:53:13,600 --> 00:53:11,780

more in-your-face kind of skeptical

1175

00:53:15,430 --> 00:53:13,610

debate that we have to get through

1176

00:53:17,950 --> 00:53:15,440

because I did a bunch of them all in a

1177

00:53:21,340 --> 00:53:17,960

row and then we'll be moving on to other

1178

00:53:25,180 --> 00:53:21,350

topics so do stay with me for all of